

Discrete Math HW 3: Learning goal P1 (solutions)

P1: I can write an appropriate proof outline for a given propositional logic formula.

Exercise 1 Write an outline for a proof of $P \rightarrow (Q \wedge R)$.

Proof. We must show $P \rightarrow (Q \wedge R)$. So suppose P ; we must show $Q \wedge R$.

In order to show $Q \wedge R$, we will show both separately.

Proof of Q (using P)

Proof of R (using P)

Since we have shown Q and R separately, therefore we have proved $Q \wedge R$.

We showed $Q \wedge R$ under the supposition that P is true; therefore $P \rightarrow (Q \wedge R)$. \square

Exercise 2 Write an outline for a proof of $P \leftrightarrow \neg Q$.

Proof. To show $P \leftrightarrow \neg Q$, we will show both directions of the implication.

(\rightarrow) First, we will show $P \rightarrow \neg Q$. Suppose P ; we must show $\neg Q$.

To show $\neg Q$, we will prove $Q \rightarrow F$. So suppose Q is true; we will derive a contradiction.

Proof that Q (and P) together make a contradiction.

Since supposing Q leads to a contradiction, therefore $\neg Q$.

We proved $\neg Q$ under the supposition P , so $P \rightarrow \neg Q$.

(\leftarrow) Next, we will show $\neg Q \rightarrow P$. Suppose $\neg Q$; we will show P .

Proof of P (using $\neg Q$)

Therefore, $\neg Q \rightarrow P$.

We have shown both $P \rightarrow \neg Q$ and $\neg Q \rightarrow P$. Therefore, $P \leftrightarrow \neg Q$. \square

Exercise 3 Write an outline for a proof of $\forall x:D. P(x) \wedge Q(x)$.

Proof. Let d be an arbitrary element of D . We will show $P(d) \wedge Q(d)$.

To prove $P(d) \wedge Q(d)$, we will prove both separately.

Proof of $P(d)$

Proof of $Q(d)$

Therefore, since we proved $P(d) \wedge Q(d)$ for an arbitrary element of D , in fact it holds for all elements of D , that is, $\forall x:D. P(x) \wedge Q(x)$. \square

Exercise 4 Write an outline for a proof of $\exists n:D. P(n) \rightarrow Q(n)$. Use a proof by contrapositive for the implication.

Proof. To show $\exists n:D. P(n) \rightarrow Q(n)$, we will show that $P(d) \rightarrow Q(d)$ holds for the specific value d in the domain D .

We will show $P(d) \rightarrow Q(d)$ using the contrapositive, $\neg Q(d) \rightarrow \neg P(d)$. So suppose $\neg Q(d)$; we will show $\neg P(d)$.

Proof of $\neg Q(d) \rightarrow \neg P(d)$ (using $\neg P(d)$)

Therefore $\neg Q(d) \rightarrow \neg P(d)$ since we proved $\neg P(d)$ under the supposition that $\neg Q(d)$ is true.

Since $P(d) \rightarrow Q(d)$ holds for the specific value d , we have proved that such an element exists, that is, $\exists x:D. P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)$. \square

Exercise 5 Prove: for all integers m and n , if mn is even, then either m is even or n is even (or both).

Translating to propositional logic, we are asked to prove

$$\forall m:\mathbb{Z}. \forall n:\mathbb{Z}. \text{Even}(mn) \rightarrow (\text{Even}(m) \vee \text{Even}(n)).$$

Proof. Let a and b be arbitrary integers; we will prove that $\text{Even}(ab) \rightarrow (\text{Even}(a) \vee \text{Even}(b))$.



To prove this implication, we will prove the contrapositive, that is,

$$\begin{aligned} \neg(\text{Even}(a) \vee \text{Even}(b)) &\rightarrow \neg\text{Even}(ab) \\ &\equiv \\ (\neg\text{Even}(a) \wedge \neg\text{Even}(b)) &\rightarrow \neg\text{Even}(ab) \end{aligned}$$

Since we are assuming $\neg\text{Even} \equiv \text{Odd}$, this is equivalent to showing

$$(\text{Odd}(a) \wedge \text{Odd}(b)) \rightarrow \text{Odd}(ab).$$

So suppose $\text{Odd}(a) \wedge \text{Odd}(b)$; we will show $\text{Odd}(ab)$.

Since we are supposing $\text{Odd}(a) \wedge \text{Odd}(b)$, that is, both a and b are odd, there must be integers j and k such that $a = 2j + 1$ and $b = 2k + 1$.

In order to show $\text{Odd}(ab)$, we must show there exists some integer l such that $ab = 2l + 1$. But

$$ab = (2j + 1)(2k + 1) = 4jk + 2j + 2k + 1 = 2(2jk + j + k) + 1,$$

and therefore $l = 2jk + j + k$ is such an integer.

We proved $\text{Odd}(ab)$ under the supposition $\text{Odd}(a) \wedge \text{Odd}(b)$, so $(\text{Odd}(a) \wedge \text{Odd}(b)) \rightarrow \text{Odd}(ab)$.

Therefore the contrapositive $\text{Even}(ab) \rightarrow (\text{Even}(a) \vee \text{Even}(b))$ holds as well.

Since we proved this for arbitrary integers a and b without assuming anything about them, in fact this is true for all integers. \square

Exercise 6 Prove: for any positive integer n , n is even if and only if $7n + 4$ is even.

We are asked to prove

$$\forall n: \text{PosInt. } \text{Even}(n) \leftrightarrow \text{Even}(7n + 4),$$

which is equivalent to

$$\forall n: \mathbb{Z}. (n > 0) \rightarrow (\text{Even}(n) \leftrightarrow \text{Even}(7n + 4)).$$

Proof. Let n be an arbitrary integer, and suppose $n > 0$. We will show $(\text{Even}(n) \leftrightarrow \text{Even}(7n + 4))$, by showing the implication in both directions.



(\rightarrow) Suppose $\text{Even}(n)$, that is, suppose there is an integer j such that $n = 2j$. Then we must show $\text{Even}(7n + 4)$, that is, $7n + 4$ is of the form $2k$ for some integer k .

$$7n + 4 = 7(2j) + 4 = 14j + 4 = 2(7j + 2).$$

If $k = (7j + 2)$ then $7n + 4 = 2k$, so we have shown $7n + 4$ is even.

(\leftarrow) In the other direction, we must show $\text{Even}(7n + 4) \rightarrow \text{Even}(n)$; we will show the contrapositive, that is, $\text{Odd}(n) \rightarrow \text{Odd}(7n + 4)$.

Suppose $\text{Odd}(n)$, that is, suppose $n = 2j + 1$ for some integer j . We will show $\text{Odd}(7n + 4)$.

$$7n + 4 = 7(2j + 1) + 4 = 14j + 11 = 2(7j + 5) + 1$$

Therefore, $7n + 4$ is odd, since it is one more than twice an integer.

We showed $\text{Odd}(n) \rightarrow \text{Odd}(7n + 4)$, which is equivalent to its contrapositive, $\text{Even}(7n + 4) \rightarrow \text{Even}(n)$.

□

We showed both directions of the biconditional for an arbitrary integer n . Note that we never actually made use of the fact that $n > 0$, so the proof in fact shows that this is true for all integers, not just positive integers.

